



Meeting Date: April 10, 2025

To: Public Works Commission

Through: Carla Short, Public Works Director
Alaric Degrafinried, Acting Deputy Director, Project Delivery

From: Tony Abuyaghi, Project Manager

Subject: Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing – Contract Award

Director's Recommendation: Award Construction Contract for Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing, in the amount of \$1,938,550 for 210 consecutive calendar days to Pioneer Contractors, Inc., to replace the roof at Bill Graham Civic Auditorium.

Contract Background: Bill Graham Civic Auditorium is an occupied historic building located at 99 Grove Street, San Francisco, in Civic Center, that hosts events, concerts, and meetings. The building was completed in 1915 as part of the Panama-Pacific International Exposition. The existing roof at Bill Graham Civic Auditorium consists of a flat roof area and an elevated octagonal area in the center of the building with four mechanical penthouses. The elevated octagonal roof was completed by Pioneer Contractors, Inc. in 2018. The proposed work is to install a new single-ply roofing membrane over the existing roof membrane throughout the low-sloped roof. The project also includes demolition and replacement of sheet metal flashings and drain replacements.

Solicitation Process: Public Works advertised the project on 01/09/2025. (5) bids were received on 02/12/2025. The average bid on the base bid was 36.96% above the engineer's estimate. The apparent lowest bidder was Pioneer Contractors, Inc., whose bid was 5.62% above the engineer's estimate. A bid protest was received from the second-lowest bidder in February 2025, and the bid protest was reviewed and determined to lack merit. Please see Attachment A: Tabulation of Bids and Attachment B: Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) Memo for more information.

Contract Details:

Contract Title:	Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing
Contract Award Amount:	\$1,938,550
Cost Estimate:	\$1,835,394
Contract Funding Sources:	General Fund

Anticipated Project Schedule:	Anticipated Start of Construction: May 2025 Substantial Completion: September 2025 Final Completion: November 2025
Contract Duration:	150 consecutive calendar days to reach substantial completion 60 consecutive calendar days thereafter to reach final completion
Contractor Name:	Pioneer Contractors, Inc
Compliance with Chapter 14B Local Business Enterprise Ordinance:	The LBE subcontracting requirement is 20%. Pioneer Contractors, Inc. met the 20% LBE requirement by committing 26% to LBE subcontractors.
Environmental Determination (if applicable):	The Planning Department has determined the Project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alteration of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemption because the Project is an alteration of the existing structure. Please see attachment C for more information.
Other Compliance:	N/A
Additional Information:	N/A
Attachments:	Attachment A - Tabulation of Bids Attachment B - Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) Memo Attachment C - CEQA Exemption Determination

**PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

RESOLUTION NO. _____

WHEREAS, On March 5, 2024, San Francisco Public Works (Public Works) entered into an agreement with the San Francisco Real Estate Division (RED) to manage the design and construction of Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing project; and

WHEREAS, The Planning Department has determined the project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alteration of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemption because the project is an alteration of the existing structure; and

WHEREAS, On December 4, 2024, the project was submitted to the San Francisco Department of Building Inspection for a construction permit application, and the application was approved on December 12, 2024; and

WHEREAS, On January 9, 2025, Public Works advertised the Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing project; and

WHEREAS, On February 12, 2025, Public Works received five bids; and

WHEREAS, Public Works staff and Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) staff reviewed the bids and determined that Pioneer Contractors, Inc. is the responsible bidder with the lowest responsive bid; and

WHEREAS, Pioneer Contractors, Inc.’s bid was \$1,938,550; and

WHEREAS, The LBE subcontracting requirement is 20%, and Pioneer Contractors, Inc. met the 20% LBE requirement by committing 26% to LBE subcontractors; and

WHEREAS, Funds are available from the General Fund; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That this Commission hereby approves the award of Construction Contract for Sourcing Event ID 000001024 - Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing, in the amount of \$1,938,550 with a duration of 210 consecutive calendar days, to the lowest responsive and responsible bidder, Pioneer Contractors, Inc.

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Public Works Commission at its meeting of _____.

Commission Affairs Manager
Public Works Commission

City and County of San Francisco
Department of Public Works
TABULATION OF BIDS

SOURCING ID: 0000010241

CONTRACT TITLE: PW BILL GRAHAM CVC AUD PH 2 ROOF

FULL TITLE: Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing

BIDS RECEIVED: February 12, 2025

<u>BIDDERS (in the order received & opened):</u>	<u>LBE Discount Claimed</u>	<u>Base Bid Price</u>	<u>Alternate 1</u>	<u>Alternate 2</u>	<u>Alternate 3</u>	<u>Alternate 4</u>	<u>Total Bid Price</u>
Best Contracting Services	N/A	\$1,940,500.00	\$119,900.00	\$144,750.00	\$17,400.00	\$39,990.00	\$2,262,540.00
Pioneer Contractors, Inc	Small-LBE 10%	\$1,938,550.00	\$73,800.00	\$271,170.00	\$260,110.00	\$26,450.00	\$2,570,080.00
Trico Construction	Micro-LBE 10%	\$2,391,840.00	\$41,958.00	\$95,630.00	\$40,601.00	\$440,019.00	\$3,010,048.00
Suffolk Construction Company, Inc	N/A	\$2,327,591.00	\$90,320.00	\$293,009.00	\$40,179.00	\$104,982.00	\$2,856,081.00
Stronger Building Services	N/A	\$3,970,000.00	\$48,000.00	\$172,000.00	\$99,000.00	\$145,000.00	\$4,434,000.00
							\$0.00
	Engineer's Estimate:	\$1,835,394.00	\$40,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$35,000.00	\$150,000.00	\$2,120,394.00
	Average Bid:	\$2,513,696.20	\$74,795.60	\$195,311.80	\$91,458.00	\$151,288.20	\$3,026,549.80
	% of Engineer's Estimate (v. Average):	136.96%	186.99%	325.52%	261.31%	100.86%	142.74%
	% of Engineer's Estimate vs. Low Bid Received	105.62%	104.90%	159.38%	49.71%	17.63%	106.70%

The following announcement was made prior to bid opening: "The Construction Budget for this Project is \$1,800,000.00, and the priority of alternates is as follows: 1, 2, 3, 4"

= Indicates a correction of the bid price after review.

cc: Tony Abuyaghi Carla Short Laure Tanigawa
James Chung Magdalena Ryor Alaric Degrafinried

For complete subcontractor listings, check: <https://bidopportunities.apps.sfdpw.org/CaseLoad/Details/2598>

February 12, 2025

City & County of San Francisco
Daniel Lurie, Mayor



Office of the City Administrator
Carmen Chu, City Administrator

Contract Monitoring Division
Stephanie Tang, Director

MEMORANDUM

Date: March 4, 2025

To: Tony Abuyaghi, PW
Ben Washington, PW

From: James Chung, CMD

Subject: CMD Review of Bids Submitted on 02/12/2025 for Bill Graham Civic Auditorium Phase 2 Roofing [0000010241]

Pioneer Contractors, Inc. is the apparent low bidder after the bid discount.

The bid discount was applied to bidders who are certified by the Contract Monitoring Division, ("CMD") as an LBE in the type of work that is specified for the bidder by the Contract Awarding Authority.

Bidder	LBE Status, Type and Size	Base Bid	LBE Bid Discount	Adjusted Bid with LBE Bid Discount
Best Contracting Services	Non-LBE	\$1,940,500.00	Not Eligible	\$1,940,500.00
Pioneer Contractors, Inc	SF LBE-MBE (Small)	\$1,938,550.00	10% = \$193,855.00	\$1,744,695.00
Trico Construction	SF LBE-WBE (Micro)	\$2,391,840.00	10% = \$239,184.00	\$2,152,656.00
Suffolk Construction Company, Inc	Non-LBE	\$2,327,591.00	Not Eligible	\$2,327,591.00
Stronger Building Services	Non-LBE	\$3,970,000.00	Not Eligible	\$3,970,000.00

Pioneer Contractors, Inc. satisfactorily demonstrated how they will meet the LBE subcontractor participation requirement.

A combination of Micro-LBE and Small-LBE participation will count toward LBE subcontractor participation compliance. Pioneer Contractors, Inc. commitment for this contract:

	Requirement %	Commitment %
Micro/Small LBE	20%	26%

In their bid, Pioneer Contractors, Inc. listed the following subcontractors on this contract.

Supplier Name	Scope of Work	LBE	LBE Size	LBE Percent	Percent of Work	Amount
Western Gravel & Roofing Supply	Materials	LBE	MICR	60%	43.33%	\$840,000.00
D&S Leong Associates	Plumbing				1.19%	\$23,000.00

Western Gravel & Roofing Supply's portion of work is credited for less than the listed amount because Western Gravel & Roofing Supply is certified with CMD as a material supplier, thus, eligible for 60% LBE credit. As such, their credited LBE participation is 26% of the total bid.

D&S Leong Associates is a certified LBE but is not eligible for LBE credit due to being unregistered with DIR at time of bid. Per Document 00 43 36, LBE subcontractors not registered with DIR at time of bid will not receive credit towards the LBE subcontractor participation requirement.

Pioneer Contractors, Inc. satisfied the "Good Faith Efforts" requirement.

Pioneer Contractors, Inc. utilized Approach A and exceeded the LBE subcontractor participation requirement by 35%.

CMD finds Pioneer Contractors, Inc. is responsive to pre-award requirements of Chapter 14B. Once awarded, the contract will be monitored for compliance with the LBE subcontractor participation commitment, as well as other 14B requirements.

Primary CMD contact for the contract: **James Chung**, James.Chung@sfgov.org

CMD must be contacted immediately for:

- Subcontractor addition/substitution;
- Contract modification that cumulatively increases the original contract value by 20%;
- Prompt payment issues;
- Any other issues pertaining to LBE subcontractor participation

Noncompliance may result in penalties, including monetary fines. Please communicate with CMD early.

JC



CEQA Exemption Determination

PROPERTY INFORMATION/PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Project Address		Block/Lot(s)
99 GROVE ST		0812001
Case No.		Permit No.
2024-010915PRL		202412046131
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Addition/ Alteration	<input type="checkbox"/> Demolition (requires HRE for Category B Building)	<input type="checkbox"/> New Construction
Project description for Planning Department approval. The project proposes to over-lay a new cover board and new single-ply roofing membrane over the existing membrane at the flat roof. All existing metal flashings will be removed and replace with new. All existing drains on the flat roof area will be removed and replaced with new, approximately 40 roof drains. There are four mechanical penthouses on the flat roof, the penthouses are approximately 10'x10' on plan and approximately 15' high, the existing metal roof panels over the penthouses will be removed and replaced with new aluminum panels. There are existing louvers and metal wall panels in the mechanical penthouses, the project will also replace the louvers and metal wall panels with new aluminum kinds. Selective surfaces will be coated, sealed, and repaired as necessary to match existing. The roof is approximately 80' above ground and surrounded by a perimeter parapet wall, the roof is not visible from the public right of way.		

EXEMPTION TYPE

The project has been determined to be exempt under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Class 1 - Existing Facilities. (CEQA Guidelines section 15301) Interior and exterior alterations; additions under 10,000 sq. ft.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Class 3 - New Construction. (CEQA Guidelines section 15303) Up to three new single-family residences or six dwelling units in one building; commercial/office structures; utility extensions; change of use under 10,000 sq. ft. if principally permitted or with a CU.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Class 32 - In-Fill Development. (CEQA Guidelines section 15332) New Construction of seven or more units or additions greater than 10,000 sq. ft. and meets the conditions described below: (a) The project is consistent with the applicable general plan designation and all applicable general plan policies as well as with applicable zoning designation and regulations. (b) The proposed development occurs within city limits on a project site of no more than 5 acres substantially surrounded by urban uses. (c) The project site has no value as habitat for endangered rare or threatened species. (d) Approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality. (e) The site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other _____
<input type="checkbox"/>	Common Sense Exemption (CEQA Guidelines section 15061(b)(3)). It can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility of a significant effect on the environment.

ENVIRONMENTAL SCREENING ASSESSMENT

Comments:

Planner Signature: Rebecca Salgado

PROPERTY STATUS - HISTORIC RESOURCE

PROPERTY IS ONE OF THE FOLLOWING:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category A: Known Historical Resource.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Category B: Potential Historical Resource (over 45 years of age).
<input type="checkbox"/>	Category C: Not a Historical Resource or Not Age Eligible (under 45 years of age).

PROPOSED WORK CHECKLIST

Check all that apply to the project.

<input type="checkbox"/>	Change of use and new construction. Tenant improvements not included.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Regular maintenance or repair to correct or repair deterioration, decay, or damage to building.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Window replacement that meets the Department's <i>Window Replacement Standards</i> .
<input type="checkbox"/>	Garage work. A new opening that meets the <i>Guidelines for Adding Garages and Curb Cuts</i> , or replacement of a garage door in an existing opening that meets the Residential Design Guidelines.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Deck, terrace construction, or fences not visible from any immediately adjacent public right-of-way.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Mechanical equipment installation that is not visible from any immediately adjacent public right-of-way.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Dormer installation that meets the requirements for exemption from public notification under <i>Zoning Administrator Bulletin No. 3: Dormer Windows</i> .
<input type="checkbox"/>	Addition(s) not visible from any immediately adjacent public right-of-way for 150 feet in each direction; or does not extend vertically beyond the floor level of the top story of the structure, or does not cause the removal of architectural significant roofing features.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Façade or storefront alterations that do not remove, alter, or obscure character -defining features.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Restoration based upon documented evidence of a building's historic condition , such as historic photographs, plans, physical evidence, or similar buildings.

Note: Project Planner must check box below before proceeding.

<input type="checkbox"/>	Project is not listed.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Project involves scope of work listed above.

ADVANCED HISTORICAL REVIEW

Check all that apply to the project.

<input type="checkbox"/>	Reclassification of property status. (<i>Attach HRER Part I relevant analysis; requires Principal Preservation Planner approval</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Reclassify to Category A <input type="checkbox"/> Reclassify to Category C <input type="checkbox"/> Lacks Historic Integrity <input type="checkbox"/> Lacks Historic Significance
<input type="checkbox"/>	Project involves a known historical resource (CEQA Category A)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Project does not substantially impact character-defining features of a historic resource (see Comments)
<input type="checkbox"/>	Project is compatible, yet differentiated, with a historic resource.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Project consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties
Note: If ANY box above is checked, a Preservation Planner MUST sign below.	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Project can proceed with EXEMPTION REVIEW. The project has been reviewed by the Preservation Planner and can proceed with exemption review.
Comments by Preservation Planner: The proposed work is all located at the existing flat roof and involves reroofing and mechanical work that will not be visible from a public right of way. No character-defining features of the property will be impacted by the work.	
Preservation Planner Signature: Rebecca Salgado	

EXEMPTION DETERMINATION

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No further environmental review is required. The project is exempt under CEQA. There are no unusual circumstances that would result in a reasonable possibility of a significant effect.	
	Project Approval Action: Building Permit	Signature: Rebecca Salgado 12/04/2024
	If discretionary review before the planning commission is requested, the discretionary review hearing is the approval action for the project.	
	Supporting documents are available for review on the San Francisco Property Information Map, which can be accessed at https://sfplanninggis.org/pim/ . Individual files can be viewed by clicking on the Planning Applications link, clicking the "More Details" link under the project's environmental record number (ENV) and then clicking on the "Related Documents" link. Once signed and dated, this document constitutes an exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines and chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Per chapter 31, an appeal of an exemption determination to the Board of Supervisors shall be filed within 30 days after the approval action occurs at a noticed public hearing, or within 30 days after posting on the planning department's website (https://sfplanning.org/resource/ceqa-exemptions) a written decision or written notice of the approval action, if the approval is not made at a noticed public hearing.	