



Meeting Date: December 02, 2022

To: Public Works Commission
Lauren Post, Chair
Fady Zoubi, Vice Chair
Lynne Newhouse Segal
Paul Woolford

Through: Carla Short, Interim Public Works Director
Ronald Alameida, Acting Deputy Director & City Architect

From: Lisa Zhuo, Project Manager

Subject: San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization – Award Construction Contract

Director’s Recommendation: Award Contract #1000027204 San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization in the amount of \$2,153,200 for 550 consecutive calendar days to CLW Builders, Inc. to modernize elevators 1-3 in San Francisco City Hall located at 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place.

Contract Background: There are 11 elevators at San Francisco City Hall. Elevator Nos. 1-6 were installed in the 1960s; elevator Nos. 7-9 were installed in the 1930s; and elevator Nos. 10-11 were installed in the 1990s. In October 2017, an elevator consultant, Syska Hennessy Group, conducted an independent study and evaluation of the City Hall elevators. While the study found that the existing elevators were operating safely, the study noted that their performance was somewhat deficient by accepted industry standards for similar equipment of this type and vintage. As a result, the elevator consultant recommended that a comprehensive equipment modernization was necessary to address performance, accessibility, safety, obsolescence, and reliability issues.

Based on Syska Hennessy’s recommendation, Public Works, in consultation with San Francisco Real Estate Division, initiated a solicitation for an outside contractor to perform the modernization work. Due to budget constraints, the project team advertised Elevator Nos. 1-3 as base bid, Elevator Nos 4-6 as bid alternate #1; Elevator Nos 10-11 as bid alternate #2; due to the conditions of Elevator Nos 7-9 there are no modernization scope appropriate for elevators of this age, therefore Elevator Nos 7-9 are excluded from this solicitation.

Solicitation Process: San Francisco Public Works advertised the City Hall Elevator Modernization project on June 30, 2022. Bids were due on August 17, 2022. A total of four (4) bids were received. All four (4) bids received were above the engineer’s estimate. Although Public Works will only award a contract for the modernization and construction portion of the

scope of services, bidder selection is based on the bidder submitting the lowest combination of the construction price plus the cost for a 5-year maintenance contract for the service of the modernized elevators. Once the elevator construction scope is complete, the San Francisco Real Estate Division (RED) will award the 5-year maintenance contract to the selected elevator service provider.

The construction budget for this project is \$2,800,000, based on the bid results, there is insufficient budget to award any of the Bid Alternates; thus, only the Base Bid can be awarded at this time.

The table below illustrates the Base Bid results comparing the four (4) bidder’s bid price. CLW Builders, Inc.’s bid package was reviewed and determined to be the lowest responsible and responsive bid at a total Bid Price of \$2,657,200; \$2,153,200 is the cost of construction to be awarded by Public Works; \$504,000 is the cost to maintain the elevators for a period of 5 years after construction completes, this is to be awarded by Real Estate Division upon completion of construction

The full tabulation of bids can be found in Attachment A.

	CLW Builders, Inc.	CF Contracting, Inc.	W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	Trico Construction
Modernize Elevators 1-3 <i>(Contract between Public Works and CLW Builders, Inc.)</i>	\$2,153,200	\$1,865,400	\$2,286,868	\$2,858,325
5-Year Maintenance Contract <i>(Contract between Real Estate Division and Elevator Subcontractor at a future date)</i>	\$504,000	\$34,830,000	\$504,000	\$504,000
TOTAL BID <i>(Low Bid Determination)</i>	\$2,657,200	\$36,695,400	\$2,790,868	\$3,362,325

Contract Details:

Contract Title:	San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization
Contract Award Amount:	\$2,153,200
Cost Estimate:	\$1,200,000
Contract Funding Sources:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Certificate of Participation – Critical Repair Program (\$2,000,000)

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • General Fund (\$153,200)
Anticipated Project Schedule:	<p>Anticipated Start of Construction: December 2022 Substantial Completion: July 2024 Final Completion: September 2024</p>
Contract Duration:	550 consecutive calendar days
Contractor Name:	CLW Builders, Inc.
Compliance with Chapter 14B Local Business Enterprise Ordinance:	Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) waived the Local Business Enterprise (LBE) Sub-contracting requirement; CLW Builders, Inc. Committed 5.02% to CMD-certified Micro-LBEs
Environmental Determination (if applicable):	On November 19, 2021, the San Francisco Planning Department determined the project categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alteration of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemptions.
Other Compliance:	N/A
Additional Information:	N/A
Attachments:	<p>Attachment A: Bid Tabulation Attachment B: Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) Memo Attachment C: SF Planning Department – Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness</p>

**PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

RESOLUTION NO. 2022-_____

WHEREAS, On February 16, 2021, San Francisco Public Works (Public Works) entered into an agreement with the San Francisco Real Estate Division (RED) to manage the design and construction of the San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization project (Project) located at 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place; and

WHEREAS, On August 23, 2021, the Project was submitted to San Francisco Department of Building Inspection for a construction permit application, and the application was approved on April 18, 2022; and

WHEREAS, On November 19, 2021, the San Francisco Planning Department determined that the Project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alterations of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemption; and

WHEREAS, On June 30, 2022, Public Works advertised the San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization project; and

WHEREAS, On August 17, 2022, Public Works received four (4) bids; and

WHEREAS, Public Works staff and Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) staff reviewed the bids and determined that CLW Builders, Inc. is the responsible bidder with the lowest responsive bid; and

WHEREAS, CLW Builders Inc.’s bid was \$2,657,200; and

WHEREAS, \$2,153,200 of the bid price is for elevator modernization work, to be awarded by Public Works to CLW Builders, Inc.; and

WHEREAS, \$504,000 of the bid price is for elevator maintenance work, to be awarded separately by San Francisco Real Estate Division (RED) to CLW Builders Inc.’s elevator subcontractor upon completion of the elevator modernization work; and

WHEREAS, Local Business Enterprise (LBE) Sub-contracting requirement was waived by CMD; and

WHEREAS, CLW Builders, Inc. committed 5.02% to CMD Certified Micro-LBEs; and

; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That this Commission hereby approves the award of Contract #1000027204 San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization, in the amount of \$2,153,200,

with a duration of 550 consecutive calendar days to the lowest responsive and responsible bidder, CLW Builders, Inc.

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Public Works Commission at its meeting of December 02, 2022

Commission Affairs Manager, Public Works Commission

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of Public Works
TABULATION OF BIDS**

Sourcing ID: 0000006607

Contract Title: PW SF CITY HALL ELEV MDRNZTN

Full Title: SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ELEVATOR MODERNIZATION

Bids Received: August 17, 2022

<u>BIDDERS (in the order received & opened):</u>	<u>LBE Status Claimed</u>	<u>Bid Price</u>	<u>Alternate 1</u>	<u>Alternate 2</u>	<u>Total Bid Price</u>
CF Contracting, Inc.	Micro-LBE 10%	\$36,695,400.00	\$1,470,000.00	\$419,951.00	\$38,585,351.00
W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	N/A	\$2,790,868.00	\$1,790,442.00	\$624,134.00	\$5,205,444.00
Trico Construction	Micro-LBE 10%	\$3,362,325.00	\$1,954,818.00	\$499,385.00	\$5,816,528.00
CLW Builders, Inc.	Small-LBE 10%	\$2,657,200.00	\$1,831,969.00	\$466,128.00	\$4,955,297.00
	Average Bid:	\$11,376,448.25	\$1,761,807.25	\$502,399.50	\$16,535,774.33
	Engineer's Estimate:	\$1,358,000.00	1,000,000.00	350,000.00	\$2,708,000.00
	% of Engineer's Estimate:	838%	176%	144%	611%
	% of Engineer's Estimate vs. Low Bid Received	196%	183%	133%	183%

The following announcement was made prior to bid opening: "The Construction Budget for this Project is \$2,800,000, and the priority of alternates is as follows: 1, 2"

= Indicates a correction of the bid price after review.

cc: Lisa Zhuo
Richard Gee
Jason Chin
Julia Laue

Carla Short
Ivan Oldenkamp
Ken Nim
Pansy Lam

Ronald Alameida
Selormey Dzikunu
Albert Ko

All Bidders

For complete subcontractor listings, check: <https://bidopportunities.apps.sfdpw.org/CaseLoad/Details/2378>

Reviewed By: Robert Loftus
(Insert Name)

Ben Washington
(Insert Name)

Sourcing ID: 0000006607
Short Title: PW SF CITY HALL ELEV MDRNZTN
Full Title: SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ELEVATOR MODERNIZATION
Bid Date: August 17, 2022

BID ITEMS	QUANTITIES	UNIT	UNIT PRICE	CF Contracting, Inc.	UNIT PRICE	W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	UNIT PRICE	Trico Construction	UNIT PRICE	CLW Builders, Inc.
				EXTENSION		EXTENSION		EXTENSION		EXTENSION
1	---	LS	---	\$1,575,000.00	---	\$2,121,268.00	---	\$2,692,725.00	---	\$1,987,600.00
2	**	**	**	\$275,400.00	**	\$150,600.00	**	\$150,600.00	**	\$150,600.00
3	---	AL	---	\$15,000.00	---	\$15,000.00	---	\$15,000.00	---	\$15,000.00
4*	***	***	***	\$34,830,000.00	***	\$504,000.00	***	\$504,000.00	***	\$504,000.00
BASE BID PRICE + BID ITEM 4:				\$36,695,400.00		\$2,790,868.00		\$3,362,325.00		\$2,657,200.00
ALT-1	---	LS	---	\$1,470,000.00	---	\$1,790,442.00	---	\$1,954,818.00	---	\$1,831,969.00
ALT-2	---	LS	---	\$419,951.00	---	\$624,134.00	---	\$499,385.00	---	\$466,128.00
TOTAL BID PRICE:				\$38,585,351.00		\$5,205,444.00		\$5,816,528.00		\$4,955,297.00

■ = Indicates a correction of the bid price after review.



GENERAL SERVICES AGENCY CONTRACT MONITORING DIVISION



London N Breed, Mayor
Carmen Chu, City Administrator

Romulus Asenloo, Director

MEMORANDUM

Date: September 2, 2022

To: Lisa Zhuo, Project Manager, SFPW
Robert Loftus, Contract Analyst, SFPW Contract Administration
Alexander Burns, Manager, SFPW Contract Administration

From: Selormey Dzikunu, Contract Compliance Manager, CMD

Subject: **000006607 SAN FRANCISCO CITY HALL ELEVATOR MODERNIZATION
REVISED CMD AWARD RECOMMENDATION**

The Contract Monitoring Division (“CMD”) has reviewed the bids submitted for the above-referenced project, applied the appropriate bid discounts, and determined responsiveness to the Chapter 14B pre-award requirements.

The LBE Sub-contracting requirement was waived for this project.
The apparent low bidder, on the base bid, CLW Builders, Inc. (CLW) was responsive to all CMD Pre-Award Requirements.

Four firms submitted Base Bids as follows:

Bidders	LBE Type	Base Bid	Bid Discount	Total Bid
CLW Builders, Inc.	Small-LBE	\$2,657,200	10%	\$2,385,000
CF Contracting, Inc.	Micro-LBE	\$2,824,650	10%	\$2,542,185
W. Lyons Construction	Non-LBE	\$2,813,782	0%	\$2,813,782
Trico Construction	Micro-LBE	\$3,355,125	10%	\$3,019,612

CLW, the lowest bidder listed the following firms on Section 00 43 36 (subcontracting List):

Subcontractor	Scope of Work	Status	Listed Amount	Amount Credited	LBE Participation
IBS USA	Misc. Steel Supports, Deco Metal and Concrete	SF-Micro-LBE-MBE	\$31,500	\$31,500	1.18%%
D&S Leong Associates	Removal of Fire Sprinkler	SF- Micro-LBE-MBE	\$9,200	\$9,200	0.34%
Yum’s Mechanical	HVAC & Louvres	SF-Micro- LBE-MBE	\$29,000	\$29,000	1.09%
KM106 Construction	Demolition/Hazmat	SF-Micro LBE- MBE	\$11,500	\$11,500	0.43%
Volk Electric	Electrical & Fire Alarm	SF=Micro LBE- OBE	\$52,000	\$52,000	1.96%
Otis Elevator Company	Elevator & Elev. Maintenance	Non-LBE	\$1,722,700	\$1,722,700	0%
TOTAL LBE Commitment				\$133,200	5.02%

CLW exceeded the 0% LBE Subcontractor Waived Participation Requirement and committed 5.02% to CMD Certified Micro-LBEs. CLW is also responsive to the 14B Good Faith Effort Outreach Requirement and therefore eligible for Contract Award.



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

ADMINISTRATIVE

Date: November 19, 2021
Record No.: **2021-010778COA**
Building Permit No.: **202108236905**
Project Address: **1 DR CARLTON B GOODLETT PL**
Landmark No: 21
Landmark District: Civic Center
Zoning: P (PUBLIC)
80-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0787/001
Project Sponsor: Lisa Zhuo
49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1000
San Francisco, CA 94103
628-271-2777
Staff Contact: Stephanie Cisneros - 628-652-7363
Stephanie.Cisneros@sfgov.org

This is to notify you that pursuant to the process and procedures adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission (“HPC”) in Motion No. 0443 and authorized by Section 1006.2 of the Planning Code, the scope of work identified in this Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness for **1 DR CARLTON B GOODLETT PL** has been delegated to the Department. The Department grants **APPROVAL** in conformance with supporting documentation marked “Exhibit A” on file in the docket for Record No. **2021-010778COA**.

Environmental Review Status

The Planning Department has determined that the proposed project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alteration of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemption because the project is an alteration of an existing structure and meets the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*.

Project Description

The proposed scope of work is as follows:

Modernization of eight elevators within City Hall at all floors, including replacement or refurbishment of existing mechanical equipment, car control panels, lobby fixtures, and car cab materials.

The proposed work conforms to the scopes of work delegated to Department Staff for Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness review in HPC Motion No. 0443. Specifically, the proposed work conforms to Scope No. 6.h., pertaining to work done within existing openings for mechanical work. All work described above is consistent with the architectural character of the building and/or district and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards*.

Findings

The project complies with the following requirements:

1. The proposed work shall be appropriate for and consistent with the effectuation of the purposes of Article 10.

The project is consistent with Article 10 of the Planning Code.

2. Compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Standard 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

The project would retain the existing public use of the subject building. The scope of work is limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and in-kind or close to in-kind replacement of related features to accommodate the upgrades.

Standard 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

The proposed work will retain and preserve the historic character of the property and will avoid removal of historic materials. Work will be limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and in-kind or close to in-kind replacement of related features.

Standard 3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

No conjectural elements are proposed. The proposed scope of work is limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and in-kind or compatible replacement of related features.

Standard 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Not Applicable.

Standard 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

The proposed work will not alter any distinctive architectural features or examples of craftsmanship. The work will be limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and compatible replacement of related features.

Standard 6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The proposed work will address deteriorated or decaying mechanical equipment related to the operation of eight elevators and associated features. Where replacement is warranted, the features and materials will be replaced with new to match in design, color, and texture.

Standard 7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Not Applicable.

Standard 8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

Not Applicable.

Standard 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Not Applicable.

Standard 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Not Applicable.

3. Conformance with the architectural character of the landmark property, as set forth in the Civic Center Landmark District designation and in the Landmark No. 21 designation report.

The project is in conformance with Section 1006.6 and Appendix J of Article 10 of the Planning Code.

5. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

Policy 1.3

Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

Policy 2.4

Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

Policy 2.5

Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.

Policy 2.7

Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.

The goal of an Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for an Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the subject building for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

6. **Planning Code Section 101.1(b)** establishes eight priority-planning policies and requires review of permits for consistency with said policies. On balance, the project complies with said policies in that:
- The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

The proposed project will have no effect on the neighborhood-serving aspects of the building.

- b. The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of the subject building in conformance with the requirements set forth in HPC Motion No. 0443 and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- c. The City's supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

The proposed project will have no effect on the City's supply of affordable housing.

- d. The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.

- e. A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

The proposed project will not affect the City's diverse economic base and will not displace any business sectors due to commercial office development.

- f. The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

Preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake is unaffected by the proposed project. Any construction or alteration associated would be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.

- g. That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved.

The proposed project respects the character-defining features of the subject building and is in conformance with the requirements set forth in HPC Motion No. 0443 and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- h. Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

The proposed Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness will not impact the City's parks and open space.

For these reasons, the above-cited work is consistent with the intent and requirements outlined in HPC Motion No. 0443 and will not be detrimental to the subject building.

Duration of this Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness: This Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness is issued pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code and is valid for a period of three (3) years

from the effective date of approval by the Planning Department, as delegated by the Historic Preservation Commission. The authorization and right vested by virtue of this action shall be deemed void and canceled if, within 3 years of the date of this Motion, a site permit or building permit for the Project has not been secured by Project Sponsor.

REQUEST FOR HEARING: If you have substantial reason to believe that there was an error in the issuance of this Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness, or abuse of discretion on the part of the Planning Department, you may file for a Request for Hearing with the Historic Preservation Commission within 20 days of the date of this letter. Should you have any questions about the contents of this letter, please contact the Planning Department at 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400 or call (628) 652-7600.

cc: Historic Preservation Commission, 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94103
San Francisco Architectural Heritage, 2007 Franklin Street, San Francisco, CA 94109
Nancy Shanahan, Planning & Zoning Committee, Telegraph Hill Dwellers, 224 Filbert Street, San Francisco, CA 94133
Finance Division, San Francisco Planning Department, 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94103

Site Photo

City Hall



Exhibit A

Elevators – please refer to attached plans for additional information and photos of existing elevator conditions.