



**Meeting Date:** September 10, 2024

**To:** Public Works Commission

**Through:** Carla Short, Public Works Director  
Ronald Alameida, Deputy Director and City Architect

**From:** Lisa Zhuo, Project Manager

**Subject:** 1 South Van Ness Avenue Elevator Modernization (REBID) – Contract Award

---

**Director’s Recommendation:** Award Construction Contract for 1 South Van Ness Avenue Elevator Modernization (REBID) - in the amount of \$2,583,542 for 610 consecutive calendar days to W.E. Lyons Construction Co. to modernize two passenger elevators at 1 South Van Ness Avenue.

**Contract Background:** The project is to modernize two existing passenger elevators at located at 1 South Van Ness Avenue.

There are a total of two passenger elevators in the facility that are designated primarily for public use and serve occupants from the basement level to the 8<sup>th</sup> floor. The two elevators are overhead gearless traction elevators installed in the 1960s; the controllers were modernized in early 2000. According to an assessment report performed by elevator consultant Syska Hennessy Group in 2019, the two passenger elevators were found to be operating safely with average performance by accepted industry standards for similar equipment of this type and vintage. Based on service records between 2016-2019, there is a steady increase in service calls each year, 75% of the service calls received between this period resulted in equipment shutdowns. Additionally, due to the age and the diminishing availability of parts, it will become increasingly challenged to service and maintain the aging elevators. The recommendation by the elevator consultant is to modernize the two passenger elevators to address performance, obsolescence, reliability, and decrease service-related calls and unplanned down time.

**Solicitation Process:** SF Public Works advertised the project on 6/30/2023 and received one (1) bid on 8/9/2023. The single bid was rejected on 9/14/2023 and rebid on 10/23/2023. Public Works received four (4) bids on 12/20/2023. The average bid on the base bid was 47% above the engineer’s estimate; the lowest base bid was from W.E. Lyons Construction, inc., their bid was 29% above the engineer’s estimate. A bid protest was received from the highest bidder in January 2024, the bid protest was reviewed and determined to lack merit. Below is a summary of the bid results, a full tabulation of bids can be found in Attachment A.

1 South Van Ness Avenue Elevator Modernization (REBID) – Contract Award  
 Public Works Commission Meeting: September 10, 2024

Item #	Bid Item	W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	City Building, Inc.	Plant Construction Company	CLW Builders, Inc.
1	<b>Modernize two (2) Passenger Elevators</b> <i>(Construction contract between SFPW and General Contractor, Inc.)</i>	\$2,583,542	\$2,808,942	\$3,178,841	\$3,200,000
2	<b>5-Year Maintenance Contract</b> <i>(Maintenance contract between Real Estate Division and Elevator Subcontractor at a future date)</i>	\$1,610,000	\$1,610,000	\$1,615,000	\$1,610,000
	<b>TOTAL BID</b>	<b>\$4,193,542</b>	<b>\$4,418,942</b>	<b>\$4,793,841</b>	<b>\$4,810,000</b>

While bidder selection is based on the bidder submitting the lowest combination of the construction cost plus the cost for a 5-year maintenance contract, Public Works will award the contract for the modernization and construction portion of the project. The San Francisco Real Estate Division will award the maintenance contract to the selected elevator service provider when the construction project is substantially completed.

**Contract Details:**

<b>Contract Title:</b>	1 South Van Ness Avenue Elevator Modernization (REBID)									
<b>Contract Award Amount:</b>	\$2,583,542									
<b>Cost Estimate:</b>	\$2,000,000									
<b>Contract Funding Sources:</b>	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Funding Source</th> <th>Funding Amount</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Certificates of Participation (COP)</td> <td>\$800,000.00</td> </tr> <tr> <td>General Fund</td> <td>\$1,783,542.00</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total</b></td> <td><b>\$2,583,542.00</b></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Funding Source	Funding Amount	Certificates of Participation (COP)	\$800,000.00	General Fund	\$1,783,542.00	<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,583,542.00</b>	
Funding Source	Funding Amount									
Certificates of Participation (COP)	\$800,000.00									
General Fund	\$1,783,542.00									
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,583,542.00</b>									
<b>Anticipated Project Schedule:</b>	Anticipated Start of Construction: December 2024 Substantial Completion: June 2026 Final Completion: August 2026									
<b>Contract Duration:</b>	550 consecutive calendar days to reach substantial completion 60 consecutive calendar days thereafter to reach final completion									
<b>Contractor Name:</b>	W.E. Lyons Construction Co.									
<b>Compliance with Chapter 14B Local</b>	Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) waived the LBE Sub-contracting requirement.									

<b>Business Enterprise Ordinance:</b>	
<b>Environmental Determination (if applicable):</b>	Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it does not result in a physical change in the environment.
<b>Other Compliance:</b>	N/A
<b>Additional Information:</b>	N/A
<b>Attachments:</b>	Attachment A: Bid Tabulation Attachment B: Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) Memo

**PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**RESOLUTION NO. \_\_\_\_\_**

WHEREAS, On April 12, 2021, San Francisco Public Works (Public Works) entered into an agreement with the San Francisco Real Estate Division (RED) to manage the design and construction of the 1 South Van Ness Elevator Modernization Project (Project); and

WHEREAS, The Project is not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Section 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it does not result in a physical change in the environment; and

WHEREAS, On March 7, 2022, the Project was submitted to San Francisco Department of Building Inspection for a construction permit application, and the application was approved on August 03, 2023; and

WHEREAS, On June 30, 2023, Public Works advertised the 1 South Van Ness Elevator Modernization project; and

WHEREAS, On August 09, 2023, Public Works received one (1) bid; and

WHEREAS, On September 14, 2023, Public Works rejected the bid; and

WHEREAS, On October 23, 2023, Public Works re-advertised the Project; and

WHEREAS, On December 20, 2023, Public Works received four (4) bids; and

WHEREAS, Public Works staff and Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) staff reviewed the bids and determined that W.E. Lyons Construction, Inc. is the responsible bidder with the lowest responsive bid; and

WHEREAS, W.E. Lyons Construction Co.'s bid was \$4,193,542; and

WHEREAS, \$2,583,542 of the bid price is for elevator modernization work, to be awarded by Public Works to W.E. Lyons Construction Co.; and

WHEREAS, \$1,610,000 of the bid price is for elevator maintenance work, to be awarded separately by San Francisco Real Estate Division to W.E. Lyons Construction Co.'s elevator subcontractor on a future date; and

WHEREAS, Local Business Enterprise (LBE) Sub-contracting requirement was waived by CMD; and

WHEREAS, Funds are available from the Certificates of Participation (COP) program and General Fund (GF); and

WHEREAS, \$800,000 of the construction contract will be funded by Certificate of Participation (COP) Program; and

WHEREAS, \$1,783,542 of the construction contract will be funded by the General Fund (GF); now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That this Commission hereby approves the award of Construction Contract for Sourcing Event ID 0000008736 - 1 South Van Ness Elevator Modernization (REBID)project, in the amount of \$2,583,542, with a duration of 610 consecutive calendar days to the lowest responsive and responsible bidder, W.E. Lyons Construction Co.

*I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Public Works Commission at its meeting of \_\_\_\_\_.*

---

Commission Affairs Manager  
Public Works Commission

**City and County of San Francisco  
Department of Public Works  
TABULATION OF BIDS**

Sourcing ID: 0000008736  
 Contract Title: PW 1 SVN ELEV MDRN  
 Full Title: 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. ELEVATOR MODERNIZATION (REBID)  
 Bids Received: December 20, 2023

<u>BIDDERS (in the order received &amp; opened):</u>	<u>LBE Status Claimed</u>	<u>Sum of Schedule A + Schedule B Bid Price</u>	<u>Alternate 1</u>	<u>Total Bid Price</u>
Plant Construction Company L.P.	N/A	\$4,793,841.00	\$1,343,651.00	\$6,137,492.00
CLW Builders, Inc.	Small-LBE 10%	\$4,810,000.00	\$842,602.00	\$5,652,602.00
W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	N/A	\$4,193,542.00	\$945,402.00	\$5,138,944.00
City Building, Inc.	N/A	\$4,418,942.00	\$975,442.00	\$5,394,384.00
	Average Bid:	\$4,554,081.25	\$1,026,774.25	\$5,580,855.50
	Engineer's Estimate:	\$2,000,000.00	\$900,000.00	\$2,900,000.00
	% of Engineer's Estimate:	228%	114%	192%
	% of Engineer's Estimate vs. Low Bid Received	210%	105%	177%

**The following announcement was made prior to bid opening: "The Construction Budget for this Project is \$2,300,000.00, and the priority of alternates is as follows: 1"**

cc: Lisa Zhuo  
 Richard Gee  
 Teenchee Le  
 Julia Laue  
 Carla Short  
 Ivan Oldenkamp  
 Ken Nim  
 Pansy Lam  
 Ronald Alameida  
 All Bidders

For complete subcontractor listings, check: <https://bidopportunities.apps.sfdpw.org/CaseLoad/Details/2488>



**MEMORANDUM**

Date: August 6, 2024

To: Ben Washington, SF Public Works  
Lisa Zhuo, Project Manager, SF Public Works

From: Ivan Oldenkamp, Contract Monitoring Division

Subject: Sourcing ID: 0000008736 1 South Van Ness Elevator Modernization Project – CMD Review

---

The Contract Monitoring Division (“CMD”) has reviewed the bids submitted for the above referenced project, applied the appropriate bid discounts, and determined responsiveness to the Chapter 14B pre-award requirements. The LBE subcontracting requirement was waived for this project. Below is a summary of CMD’s review.

Bidder	LBE Status	Base Bid	LBE Bid Discount	Adjusted Bid with Bid Discount
W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	Non-LBE	\$4,193,542.00	0%	\$4,193,542.00
CLW Builders Inc.	SF LBE - MBE (Micro)	\$4,810,000.00	10%	\$4,329,000.00
City Building, Inc.	Non-LBE	\$4,418,942.00	0%	\$4,418,942.00
Plant Construction Company L.P.	Non-LBE	\$4,793,841.00	0%	\$4,793,841.00

The following announcement was made prior to bid opening: "The Construction Budget for this Project is \$2,300,000.00, and the priority of alternates is as follows: 1"

Section 00 41 00 states that “The City reserves the right to award to the responsible Bidder who submits the lowest responsive Bid based on: 1. The Total Bid Price (Sum of Total Bid Price of Schedule A + Schedule B) and all deductive alternates in the event that the Total Bid Price and all deductive alternates exceeds the construction budget amount, or 2. The Total Bid Price (Sum of Total Bid Price of Schedule A + Schedule B) without alternates in the event that the Total Bid Price exceeds the construction budget amount. and there are no deductive alternates.”

**Alternate Bid Information**

<b>Bidder</b>	<b>Schedule A + Schedule B Price</b>	<b>Alternate 1</b>	<b>Total Bid</b>
W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	\$4,193,542.00	\$945,402.00	\$5,138,944.00
CLW Builders Inc.	\$4,810,000.00	\$842,602.00	\$5,652,602.00
City Building, Inc.	\$4,418,942.00	\$975,442.00	\$5,394,384.00
Plant Construction Company L.P.	\$4,793,841.00	\$1,343,651.00	\$6,137,492.00

W.E. Lyons Construction Co. (“Lyons”) is the lowest responsive bidder.

Lyons listed the following LBE firms on Section 00 43 36 at time of bid:

<b>LBE Subcontractor</b>	<b>Scope of Work</b>	<b>Status</b>	<b>Percent LBE</b>	<b>Listed Amount</b>	<b>Amount Credited</b>	<b>Percent of Work</b>
Bird Electric Inc.	Electrical	SF LBE - OBE (Micro)	100%	\$114,000.00	\$114,000.00	2.72%
<b>TOTAL</b>				<b>\$114,000.00</b>	<b>\$114,000.00</b>	<b>2.72%</b>

Lyons has also listed the following non-LBE subcontractors:

<b>Non-LBE Subcontractor</b>	<b>Scope of Work</b>	<b>Status</b>	<b>Listed Amount</b>
G.K. Welding	Steel	Non-LBE	\$58,304
Valdez Painting	Paint	Non-LBE	\$15,709
TK Elevator	Elevator	Non-LBE	\$1,130,000
Walschon Fire Protection	Fire sprinklers	Non-LBE	\$13,499
Dryco Construction Co.	ADA upgrades	Non-LBE	\$63,860
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>\$1,281,372</b>

Based on the foregoing, CMD has determined that W.E. Lyons Construction Co. has complied with the Chapter 14B pre-award requirements. Should you have any questions, please contact Ivan Oldenkamp at [ivan.oldenkamp@sfgov.org](mailto:ivan.oldenkamp@sfgov.org)