



Meeting Date: February 12, 2024

To: Public Works Commission

Through: Carla Short, Public Works Director
Ronald Alameida, Acting Deputy Director & City Architect

From: Lisa Zhuo, Project Manager

Subject: San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization - Contract Modification

Director's Recommendation: Approve an increase of \$2,748,924 and 560 calendar days to Contract No. 1000027204 San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization with CLW Builders, Inc.; and authorize the Director of Public Works to approve future modifications to the contract for a total contract amount of up to \$5,117,444 and total contract duration of up to 1,231 calendar days.

Contract Background: There are 11 elevators at San Francisco City Hall. Elevator Nos. 1-6 were installed in the 1960s; elevator Nos. 7-9 were installed in the 1930s; and elevator Nos. 10-11 were installed in the 1990s. In October 2017, an elevator consultant, Syska Hennessy Group, conducted an independent study and evaluation of the City Hall elevators. While the study found that the existing elevators were operating safely, the study noted that their performance was somewhat deficient by accepted industry standards for similar equipment of this type and vintage. As a result, the elevator consultant recommended that a comprehensive equipment modernization was necessary to address performance, accessibility, safety, obsolescence, and reliability issues.

Based on Syska Hennessy's recommendation, Public Works, in consultation with San Francisco Real Estate Division, initiated a solicitation for an outside contractor to perform the modernization work. Due to budget constraints, the project team advertised Elevator Nos. 1-3 as base bid, Elevator Nos 4-6 as bid alternate #1; Elevator Nos 10-11 as bid alternate #2; due to the age of Elevator Nos 7-9 there are no modernization scope appropriate for elevators of this age, therefore Elevator Nos 7-9 were excluded from this solicitation.

On December 2, 2022, Public Works awarded the construction contract to CLW Builders, Inc. in the amount of \$2,153,200 (Commission Resolution No. 2022-0024); Notice to proceed was issued on Feb 7, 2023.

Reason for Modification: In fiscal year 23/24 Public Works received an additional \$3 million in funding from the Critical Repair and Recovery Stimulus Program to modernize additional elevators at City Hall that were not included in the base contract. This modification request in

the amount of \$2,748,924 is to add modernization work for Elevator Nos 4-6 and Elevator Nos 10-11.

Contract Details:

Contract Title:	San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization
Contract Original Award Amount:	\$2,153,200
Contract Original Duration:	610 Calendar Days
Contractor Name:	CLW Builders, Inc.

Summary of Contract Value:

Contract Cost Amount	Amounts
Original Contract Amount:	\$2,153,200
Original Contingency Amount:	\$215,320
Previously Approved Cost Increase:	\$0
Additional Cost Increase Requested Now:	\$2,748,924
Authorized Contract Cost:	\$5,117,444

Contract Duration	Days
Original Contract Duration (Substantial & Final Completion):	610
Original Contingency Duration:	61
Previously Approved Time Increase:	0
Additional Time Increase Requested Now:	560
Authorized Contract Duration:	1,231

Contract Funding Sources:	Certificates of Participation – Critical Repair Program General Fund
Compliance Information:	Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) waived the LBE Sub-contracting requirement.
Environmental Determine (if applicable):	On November 19, 2021, the San Francisco Planning Department determined the project categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alteration of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemption because the project is an alteration of an existing structure and meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization - Contract Modification
Public Works Commission Meeting: February 12, 2024

Additional Information:	N/A
Attachments:	Attachment A: SF Planning Department – Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness

**PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

RESOLUTION NO. _____

WHEREAS, On February 16, 2021, San Francisco Public Works (Public Works) entered into an agreement with the San Francisco Real Estate Division (RED) to manage the design and construction of the San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization project (Project) located at 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place; and

WHEREAS, On August 23, 2021, the Project was submitted to San Francisco Department of Building Inspection for a construction permit application, and the application was approved on April 18, 2022; and

WHEREAS, On November 19, 2021, the San Francisco Planning Department determined that the Project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alterations of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemption; and

WHEREAS, On June 30, 2022, Public Works advertised the San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization project; and

WHEREAS, On August 17, 2022, Public Works received four bids where CLW Builders, Inc. was determined as the lowest responsible and responsive bidder; and

WHEREAS, On December 2, 2022, the San Francisco Public Works Commission approved Resolution No. 2022-0024, awarding Contract No. 1000027204 to CLW Builders, Inc.; and

WHEREAS, Public Works issued the Notice-to-Proceed to CLW Builders, Inc. on Feb 7, 2023; and

WHEREAS, The awarded contract amount was \$2,153,200; and

WHEREAS, The awarded duration was 610 calendar days; and

WHEREAS, An increase of \$2,748,924 and 560 calendar days to the contract duration is requested for the San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization Project; now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, That this Commission hereby approves an increase of \$2,748,924 and 560 calendar days to the San Francisco City Hall Elevator Modernization contract with CLW Builders, Inc.; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That this Commission hereby authorizes the Director of Public Works to approve future modifications to the contract for a total contract cost of up to \$5,117,444 and total contract duration of up to 1231 calendar days.

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Public Works Commission at its meeting of _____.

Commission Affairs Manager
Public Works Commission



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

ADMINISTRATIVE

Date: November 19, 2021
Record No.: **2021-010778COA**
Building Permit No.: **202108236905**
Project Address: **1 DR CARLTON B GOODLETT PL**
Landmark No: 21
Landmark District: Civic Center
Zoning: P (PUBLIC)
80-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0787/001
Project Sponsor: Lisa Zhuo
49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1000
San Francisco, CA 94103
628-271-2777
Staff Contact: Stephanie Cisneros - 628-652-7363
Stephanie.Cisneros@sfgov.org

This is to notify you that pursuant to the process and procedures adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission (“HPC”) in Motion No. 0443 and authorized by Section 1006.2 of the Planning Code, the scope of work identified in this Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness for **1 DR CARLTON B GOODLETT PL** has been delegated to the Department. The Department grants **APPROVAL** in conformance with supporting documentation marked “Exhibit A” on file in the docket for Record No. **2021-010778COA**.

Environmental Review Status

The Planning Department has determined that the proposed project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 (State CEQA Guidelines 15301 – Minor alteration of existing facilities with negligible or no expansion of use) Categorical Exemption because the project is an alteration of an existing structure and meets the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*.

Project Description

The proposed scope of work is as follows:

Modernization of eight elevators within City Hall at all floors, including replacement or refurbishment of existing mechanical equipment, car control panels, lobby fixtures, and car cab materials.

The proposed work conforms to the scopes of work delegated to Department Staff for Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness review in HPC Motion No. 0443. Specifically, the proposed work conforms to Scope No. 6.h., pertaining to work done within existing openings for mechanical work. All work described above is consistent with the architectural character of the building and/or district and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards*.

Findings

The project complies with the following requirements:

1. The proposed work shall be appropriate for and consistent with the effectuation of the purposes of Article 10.

The project is consistent with Article 10 of the Planning Code.

2. Compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Standard 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

The project would retain the existing public use of the subject building. The scope of work is limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and in-kind or close to in-kind replacement of related features to accommodate the upgrades.

Standard 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

The proposed work will retain and preserve the historic character of the property and will avoid removal of historic materials. Work will be limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and in-kind or close to in-kind replacement of related features.

Standard 3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

No conjectural elements are proposed. The proposed scope of work is limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and in-kind or compatible replacement of related features.

Standard 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Not Applicable.

Standard 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

The proposed work will not alter any distinctive architectural features or examples of craftsmanship. The work will be limited to mechanical upgrades for existing elevators and compatible replacement of related features.

Standard 6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The proposed work will address deteriorated or decaying mechanical equipment related to the operation of eight elevators and associated features. Where replacement is warranted, the features and materials will be replaced with new to match in design, color, and texture.

Standard 7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Not Applicable.

Standard 8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

Not Applicable.

Standard 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Not Applicable.

Standard 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Not Applicable.

3. Conformance with the architectural character of the landmark property, as set forth in the Civic Center Landmark District designation and in the Landmark No. 21 designation report.

The project is in conformance with Section 1006.6 and Appendix J of Article 10 of the Planning Code.

5. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

Policy 1.3

Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

Policy 2.4

Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

Policy 2.5

Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.

Policy 2.7

Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.

The goal of an Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for an Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the subject building for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

6. **Planning Code Section 101.1(b)** establishes eight priority-planning policies and requires review of permits for consistency with said policies. On balance, the project complies with said policies in that:
- The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

The proposed project will have no effect on the neighborhood-serving aspects of the building.

- b. The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of the subject building in conformance with the requirements set forth in HPC Motion No. 0443 and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- c. The City's supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

The proposed project will have no effect on the City's supply of affordable housing.

- d. The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.

- e. A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

The proposed project will not affect the City's diverse economic base and will not displace any business sectors due to commercial office development.

- f. The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

Preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake is unaffected by the proposed project. Any construction or alteration associated would be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.

- g. That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved.

The proposed project respects the character-defining features of the subject building and is in conformance with the requirements set forth in HPC Motion No. 0443 and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- h. Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

The proposed Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness will not impact the City's parks and open space.

For these reasons, the above-cited work is consistent with the intent and requirements outlined in HPC Motion No. 0443 and will not be detrimental to the subject building.

Duration of this Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness: This Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness is issued pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code and is valid for a period of three (3) years

from the effective date of approval by the Planning Department, as delegated by the Historic Preservation Commission. The authorization and right vested by virtue of this action shall be deemed void and canceled if, within 3 years of the date of this Motion, a site permit or building permit for the Project has not been secured by Project Sponsor.

REQUEST FOR HEARING: If you have substantial reason to believe that there was an error in the issuance of this Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness, or abuse of discretion on the part of the Planning Department, you may file for a Request for Hearing with the Historic Preservation Commission within 20 days of the date of this letter. Should you have any questions about the contents of this letter, please contact the Planning Department at 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400 or call (628) 652-7600.

cc: Historic Preservation Commission, 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94103
San Francisco Architectural Heritage, 2007 Franklin Street, San Francisco, CA 94109
Nancy Shanahan, Planning & Zoning Committee, Telegraph Hill Dwellers, 224 Filbert Street, San Francisco, CA 94133
Finance Division, San Francisco Planning Department, 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94103

Site Photo

City Hall



Exhibit A

Elevators – please refer to attached plans for additional information and photos of existing elevator conditions.