



Meeting Date: April 22, 2024

To: Public Works Commission

Through: Carla Short, Public Works Director
Ronald Alameida, Deputy Director and City Architect

From: Lisa Zhuo, Project Manager

Subject: Davies Symphony Elevator Modernization Phase 2 (REBID) - Award Construction Contract

Director's Recommendation: Award Contract # 1000032384 for Davies Symphony Hall Elevator Modernization Phase 2 (REBID) in the amount of \$1,415,595 for 610 consecutive calendar days to W.E. Lyons Construction Co. to modernize elevators 1 and 2 in the San Francisco Davies Symphony Hall located at 201 Van Ness Avenue.

Contract Background: The project is to modernize two existing passenger elevators at Davies Symphony Hall, located at 201 Van Ness Avenue.

There are a total of three passenger elevators in the facility that are designated primarily for public use, the three elevators were original to the building and installed in 1980. According to an assessment report completed in 2017 by Syska Hennessy Group the elevators have experienced leveling and declining reliability issues. While the elevators are found to be operating safely, their performance is somewhat deficient by accepted industry standards for similar equipment of this type and vintage. A full-scale equipment modernization was recommended to improve performance, accessibility, safety, and address obsolescence and reliability issues. Elevator #3 was modernized in 2021; the scope for this contract is to modernize Elevator #1 and #2.

Solicitation Process: SF Public Works advertised the project on 8/31/2023 and received one (1) bid on 10/25/2023. The single bid was rejected on 11/30/2023 because it was determined to be non-responsive; the project was re-advertised on 12/4/2023, and Public Works received four (4) bids on 12/20/2023. The average bid was 95% of the engineer's estimate; the lowest bid was from W.E. Lyons Construction, inc., their bid was 76% of the engineer's estimate. Below is a summary of the bid results, a full tabulation of bids can be found in Attachment A.

Davies Symphony Elevator Modernization Phase 2 (REBID) - Award Construction Contract Public Works
 Commission Meeting: April 22, 2024

	CLW Builders, Inc.	Plant Construction	W.E. Lyons Construction Co.	Rodan Builders, Inc.
Modernize Elevators 1-2 <i>(Construction contract between SFPW and General Contractor, Inc.)</i>	\$1,998,000	\$1,643,294	1,415,595	\$1,943,658
3-Year Maintenance Contract <i>(Maintenance contract between Real Estate Division and Elevator Subcontractor at a future date)</i>	\$128,000	\$128,000	\$101,300	\$261,316
TOTAL BID	\$2,126,000	\$1,771,294	\$1,516,895	\$2,204,974

While bidder selection is based on the bidder submitting the lowest combination of the construction cost plus the cost for a 3-year maintenance contract, Public Works will award the contract for the modernization and construction portion of the project. The San Francisco War Memorial & Performing Arts Center will award the maintenance contract to the selected elevator service provider when the construction project is substantially completed.

Contract Details:

Contract Title:	Davies Symphony Hall Elevator Modernization Phase 2 (REBID)
Contract Award Amount:	\$1,415,595
Cost Estimate:	\$2,000,000
Contract Funding Sources:	Certificate of Participation Critical Repairs / Recovery Stimulus
Anticipated Project Schedule:	Anticipated Start of Construction: May 2024 Substantial Completion: November 2025 Final Completion: January 2026
Contract Duration:	550 consecutive calendar days to reach substantial completion 60 consecutive calendar days thereafter to reach final completion
Contractor Name:	W.E. Lyons Construction Co.
Compliance with Chapter 14B Local Business Enterprise Ordinance:	Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) waived the LBE Sub-contracting requirement.

Davies Symphony Elevator Modernization Phase 2 (REBID) - Award Construction Contract Public Works
Commission Meeting: April 22, 2024

Environmental Determination (if applicable):	Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it does not result in a physical change in the environment.
Other Compliance:	N/A
Additional Information:	N/A
Attachments:	Attachment A: Bid Tabulation Attachment B: Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) Memo

**PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

RESOLUTION NO. _____

WHEREAS, On June 30, 2022, San Francisco Public Works (Public Works) entered into an agreement with the San Francisco War Memorial & Performing Arts Center (WAR) to manage the design and construction of the San Francisco Davies Symphony Hall Elevator Modernization – Phase 2 project (Project) located at 201 Van Ness Avenue; and

WHEREAS, The Project is not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Section 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it does not result in a physical change in the environment; and

WHEREAS, On July 27, 2023, the Project was submitted to San Francisco Department of Building Inspection for a construction permit application, and the application was approved on August 24, 2023; and

WHEREAS, On August 31, 2023, Public Works advertised the San Francisco Davies Symphony Hall Elevator Modernization – Phase 2 project; and

WHEREAS, On October 25, 2023, Public Works received one (1) bid; and

WHEREAS, On November 30, 2023, Public Works rejected the bid on grounds that it was non-responsive; and

WHEREAS, On December 14, 2023, Public Works re-advertised the Project; and

WHEREAS, On December 20, 2023, Public Works received four (4) bids; and

WHEREAS, Public Works staff and Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) staff reviewed the bids and determined that W.E. Lyons Construction, Inc. is the responsible bidder with the lowest responsive bid; and

WHEREAS, W.E. Lyons Construction Co.’s bid was \$1,516,895; and

WHEREAS, \$1,415,595 of the bid price is for elevator modernization work, to be awarded by Public Works to W.E. Lyons Construction Co.; and

WHEREAS, \$101,300 of the bid price is for elevator maintenance work, to be awarded separately by San Francisco War Memorial & Performing Arts Center to W.E. Lyons Construction Co.’s elevator subcontractor on a future date; and

WHEREAS, Local Business Enterprise (LBE) Sub-contracting requirement was waived by CMD; and

WHEREAS, Funds are available from the Certificate of Participation (COP) – Critical Repair / Stimulus Recovery Program; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That this Commission hereby approves the award of Contract #1000032384 for San Francisco Davies Symphony Hall Elevator Modernization - Phase 2, in the amount of \$1,415,595, with a duration of 610 consecutive calendar days to the lowest responsive and responsible bidder, W.E. Lyons Construction Co.

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Public Works Commission at its meeting of _____.

Commission Affairs Manager
Public Works Commission

**City and County of San Francisco
Department of Public Works
TABULATION OF BIDS**

Sourcing ID: 0000008913

Contract Title: PW DAVIES SYMPHONY HALL ELV P2 [Rebid]

Full Title: DAVIES SYMPHONY HALL ELEVATOR MODERNIZATION - PHASE 2 [Rebid]

Bids Received: December 20, 2023

<u>BIDDERS (in the order received & opened):</u>	<u>LBE Status Claimed</u>	<u>Total Bid Price</u>
Plant Construction Company L.P.	N/A	\$1,771,294.00
W.E. Lyons Construction	N/A	\$1,516,895.00
Rodan Builders, Inc.	N/A	\$2,204,974.00
CLW Builders, Inc.	Small-LBE 10%	\$2,126,000.00
	Average Bid:	\$1,904,790.75
	Engineer's Estimate:	\$2,000,000.00
	% of Engineer's Estimate:	95%
	% of Engineer's Estimate vs. Low Bid Received	76%

cc:	Lisa Zhuo	Carla Short	Ronald Alameida
	Richard Gee	Ivan Oldenkamp	Selormey Dzikunu
	Teenchee Le	Ken Nim	All Bidders
	Julia Laue	Pansy Lam	

For complete subcontractor listings, check: <https://bidopportunities.apps.sfdpw.org/CaseLoad/Details/2492>



MEMORANDUM

Date: March 6, 2024

To: Robert Loftus, Contract Administration, SF Public Works
Ben Washington, Contract Administration, SF Public Works
Lisa Zhuo, Project Manager, SF Public Works

From: Ivan Oldenkamp, Contract Monitoring Division

Subject: Sourcing ID: 0000008913 Davies Symphony Hall Elevator Modernization Phase 2 (REBID) – CMD Review

The Contract Monitoring Division (“CMD”) has reviewed the bids submitted for the above referenced project, applied the appropriate bid discounts, and determined responsiveness to the Chapter 14B pre-award requirements. The 14B LBE subcontracting requirement was waived for this project. Below is a summary of CMD’s review.

Bidder	LBE Status	Base Bid	LBE Bid Discount	Adjusted Bid with Bid Discount
W.E. Lyons Construction, Inc.	Non-LBE	\$1,415,595.00	0%	\$1,415,595.00
Plant Construction	Non-LBE	\$1,643,294.00	0%	\$1,643,294.00
CLW Builders, Inc.	SF LBE - MBE (Small)	\$1,998,000.00	10%	\$1,798,200.00
Rodan Builders, Inc.	Non-LBE	\$1,943,658.00	0%	\$1,943,658.00

W.E. Lyons Construction, Inc., (“W.E. Lyons”) is the lowest responsive bidder. W.E. Lyons did not list any LBE subcontractors.

W.E. Lyons listed the following non-LBE subcontractors:

Non-LBE Subcontractor	Scope of Work	Status	Listed Amount
Performance Abatement Services	Abatement	Non-LBE	\$8,710.00
EnPro	Elevator	Non-LBE	\$736,400.00
Revolt	Electrical	Non-LBE	\$68,768.00
TOTAL			\$813,878.00

Based on the foregoing, CMD has determined that W.E. Lyons has complied with the Chapter 14B pre-award requirements. Should you have any questions, please contact Ivan Oldenkamp at ivan.oldenkamp@sfgov.org